

**To:** Grantham, Nancy[Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov]; StClair, Christie[StClair.Christie@epa.gov]; Cohen, Nancy[Cohen.Nancy@epa.gov]  
**From:** Deitz, Randy  
**Sent:** Thur 3/17/2016 8:30:23 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Daily Caller (DDL 12:30pm EST): GKM + Navajo Nation

If would not hurt to have a statement drafted. There is a reason why the DOI report was scoped, implemented as, and called, a "technical" evaluation.

Randy Deitz

Attorney Advisor

Office of Land and Emergency Management

(202) 566-0197

**From:** Grantham, Nancy  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 17, 2016 3:50 PM  
**To:** StClair, Christie <StClair.Christie@epa.gov>; Cohen, Nancy <Cohen.Nancy@epa.gov>; Deitz, Randy <Deitz.Randy@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Daily Caller (DDL 12:30pm EST): GKM + Navajo Nation

## Deliberative Process/Ex. 5

**From:** StClair, Christie  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 17, 2016 3:48 PM  
**To:** Grantham, Nancy <[Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov)>; Cohen, Nancy <[Cohen.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Cohen.Nancy@epa.gov)>; Deitz, Randy <[Deitz.Randy@epa.gov](mailto:Deitz.Randy@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: Daily Caller (DDL 12:30pm EST): GKM + Navajo Nation

## Deliberative Process/Ex. 5

<http://www.navajo-nsn.gov/News%20Releases/OPVP/2016/mar/President%20Begaye's%20Statement%20on%20Federal%20Investigation%20of%20the%20Navajo%20Nation>

**Christie St. Clair**

Office of Public Affairs

Environmental Protection Agency

Washington, DC

o: 202-564-2880

m: 202-768-5780

**From:** Manzanilla, Enrique

**Sent:** Thursday, March 17, 2016 2:54 PM

**To:** Chilingaryan, Sona <[Chilingaryan.Sona@epa.gov](mailto:Chilingaryan.Sona@epa.gov)>; StClair, Christie <[StClair.Christie@epa.gov](mailto:StClair.Christie@epa.gov)>; Grantham, Nancy <[Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov)>; Zito, Kelly <[ZITO.KELLY@EPA.GOV](mailto:ZITO.KELLY@EPA.GOV)>

**Cc:** Keener, Bill <[Keener.Bill@epa.gov](mailto:Keener.Bill@epa.gov)>; Tenley, Clancy <[Tenley.Clancy@epa.gov](mailto:Tenley.Clancy@epa.gov)>; Allen, HarryL <[Allen.HarryL@epa.gov](mailto:Allen.HarryL@epa.gov)>; Minor, Dustin <[Minor.Dustin@epa.gov](mailto:Minor.Dustin@epa.gov)>; BERMAN, TESSA <[Berman.Tessa@epa.gov](mailto:Berman.Tessa@epa.gov)>; Mitchell, Stacey <[Mitchell.Stacey@epa.gov](mailto:Mitchell.Stacey@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Daily Caller (DDL 12:30pm EST): GKM + Navajo Nation

I hadn't seen this...

<http://www.navajo-nsn.gov/News%20Releases/OPVP/2016/mar/President%20Begaye's%20Statement%20on%20Federal%20Investigation%20of%20the%20Navajo%20Nation>

Enrique Manzanilla

Director, Superfund Division

US EPA Region 9 - Pacific Southwest

(415) 972 3843

**From:** Chilingaryan, Sona  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 17, 2016 9:34 AM  
**To:** StClair, Christie <[StClair.Christie@epa.gov](mailto:StClair.Christie@epa.gov)>; Grantham, Nancy <[Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov)>; Zito, Kelly <[ZITO.KELLY@EPA.GOV](mailto:ZITO.KELLY@EPA.GOV)>  
**Cc:** Keener, Bill <[Keener.Bill@epa.gov](mailto:Keener.Bill@epa.gov)>; Manzanilla, Enrique <[Manzanilla.Enrique@epa.gov](mailto:Manzanilla.Enrique@epa.gov)>; Tenley, Clancy <[Tenley.Clancy@epa.gov](mailto:Tenley.Clancy@epa.gov)>; Allen, HarryL <[Allen.HarryL@epa.gov](mailto:Allen.HarryL@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Daily Caller (DDL 12:30pm EST): GKM + Navajo Nation

Good thinking, Christie. How about adding the sentence in green to this paragraph. I'm also removing the bit about drinking water because that hasn't come up as much in terms of analysis.

The agency has provided the data to the Navajo Nation so that they can compare them to the Nation's standards for agriculture and drinking water. The agency has also compared data for the stretch of the San Juan River on Navajo Nation to Navajo Nation's agricultural standards, and shared that analysis with the Tribe. On August 24, 2015, Navajo Nation President Begaye reported that the Navajo Nation EPA had determined the water from the San Juan River was safe for irrigation purposes. On August 28, the President lifted irrigation restrictions on the San Juan River for the Chapters of Upper Fruitland, San Juan and Nenahnezad Chapters.

---

**From:** StClair, Christie  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 17, 2016 9:18 AM  
**To:** Grantham, Nancy; Chilingaryan, Sona; Zito, Kelly  
**Cc:** Keener, Bill  
**Subject:** RE: Daily Caller (DDL 12:30pm EST): GKM + Navajo Nation

OK, thanks Nancy.

## Deliberative Process/Ex. 5

Christie St. Clair

Office of Public Affairs

Environmental Protection Agency

Washington, DC

o: 202-564-2880

m: 202-768-5780

**From:** Grantham, Nancy

**Sent:** Thursday, March 17, 2016 12:09 PM

**To:** StClair, Christie <[StClair.Christie@epa.gov](mailto:StClair.Christie@epa.gov)>; Chilingaryan, Sona <[Chilingaryan.Sona@epa.gov](mailto:Chilingaryan.Sona@epa.gov)>; Zito, Kelly <[ZITO.KELLY@EPA.GOV](mailto:ZITO.KELLY@EPA.GOV)>

**Cc:** Keener, Bill <[Keener.Bill@epa.gov](mailto:Keener.Bill@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Daily Caller (DDL 12:30pm EST): GKM + Navajo Nation

I would say not to share – given that they are dated and we have lots of things in the mix data wise – so don't want to add anything else thnsk ng

**From:** StClair, Christie

**Sent:** Thursday, March 17, 2016 12:04 PM

**To:** Chilingaryan, Sona <[Chilingaryan.Sona@epa.gov](mailto:Chilingaryan.Sona@epa.gov)>; Zito, Kelly <[ZITO.KELLY@EPA.GOV](mailto:ZITO.KELLY@EPA.GOV)>

**Cc:** Keener, Bill <[Keener.Bill@epa.gov](mailto:Keener.Bill@epa.gov)>; Grantham, Nancy <[Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Daily Caller (DDL 12:30pm EST): GKM + Navajo Nation

I was thinking we'd share them as an example of what we provided during the response, and noting the date.

Christie St. Clair

Office of Public Affairs

Environmental Protection Agency

Washington, DC

o: 202-564-2880

m: 202-768-5780

**From:** Chilingaryan, Sona

**Sent:** Thursday, March 17, 2016 12:03 PM

**To:** Zito, Kelly <[ZITO.KELLY@EPA.GOV](mailto:ZITO.KELLY@EPA.GOV)>; StClair, Christie <[StClair.Christie@epa.gov](mailto:StClair.Christie@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Keener, Bill <[Keener.Bill@epa.gov](mailto:Keener.Bill@epa.gov)>; Grantham, Nancy <[Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** Re: Daily Caller (DDL 12:30pm EST): GKM + Navajo Nation

Hi! I don't think it's a good idea to share those graphics at this point-- they're out of date and incomplete. We're hoping to update those soon and will have them for future inquiries.

---

**From:** Zito, Kelly

**Sent:** Thursday, March 17, 2016 8:49 AM

**To:** StClair, Christie; Chilingaryan, Sona

**Cc:** Keener, Bill; Grantham, Nancy

**Subject:** RE: Daily Caller (DDL 12:30pm EST): GKM + Navajo Nation

Adding Sona – since she has a better bead on the data

**From:** StClair, Christie

**Sent:** Thursday, March 17, 2016 8:42 AM

**To:** Zito, Kelly <[ZITO.KELLY@EPA.GOV](mailto:ZITO.KELLY@EPA.GOV)>  
**Cc:** Keener, Bill <[Keener.Bill@epa.gov](mailto:Keener.Bill@epa.gov)>; Grantham, Nancy <[Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Daily Caller (DDL 12:30pm EST): GKM + Navajo Nation

Not sure, I will check.

Also, do we want to provide the reporter with the graphs (attached) that R9 shared with NN stakeholders during the response? They compare water quality to NN's livestock standards, so

## **Deliberative Process/Ex. 5**

Christie St. Clair

Office of Public Affairs

Environmental Protection Agency

Washington, DC

o: 202-564-2880

m: 202-768-5780

**From:** Zito, Kelly  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 17, 2016 10:50 AM  
**To:** StClair, Christie <[StClair.Christie@epa.gov](mailto:StClair.Christie@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Keener, Bill <[Keener.Bill@epa.gov](mailto:Keener.Bill@epa.gov)>; Grantham, Nancy <[Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Grantham.Nancy@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Daily Caller (DDL 12:30pm EST): GKM + Navajo Nation

Thanks Christie - We will get back to you this morn. On the \$2 million - is that available now, as indicated below, or is some of that funding still in the works?

Thanks-

Kelly

Sent from my iPhone

On Mar 17, 2016, at 7:29 AM, "StClair, Christie" <[StClair.Christie@epa.gov](mailto:StClair.Christie@epa.gov)> wrote:

Ethan Barton of the Daily Caller has questions based on an interview he just did with President Begaye.

I've drafted responses based on previously used info, with one highlighted exception. The highlighted sentence is based on recent feedback on the data calls – it's the first time we will be saying this.

Please send any edits by 12:30pm EST.

Thanks,

Christie

1. He told me that reported, successful Navajo suicides spiked since the spill, though he couldn't establish a direct correlation.

No comment

2. Begaye also said the EPA isn't holding up to its promises, isn't monitoring the soil and water as promised, and is using a water quality standard that allows for many more contaminants than what is typically allowed for agriculture and drinking. He noted that consistent monitoring and guidance is critical, as farmers will soon need to rely on the contaminated rivers as irrigation sources.

EPA performed the first round of monitoring in October and November in accordance with the September 2015 draft "Post Gold King Mine Release Incident: Conceptual Monitoring Plan for Surface Water, Sediment and Biology." Under the plan, EPA is examining water quality, sediment quality, biological community and fish tissue under a variety of flow conditions at 26 sites, across seasonal conditions. The sites are located within Colorado, Southern Ute Indian Reservation, New Mexico, Ute Mountain Ute Reservation, the Navajo Nation and Utah, spanning Cement Creek, the Animas and San Juan rivers, and the upper section of Lake Powell.

Metals that could pose a risk to human safety at high concentrations were tested against the agency's risk-based recreational screening levels. The conservative screening values assume adults and children who are hiking and camping near the river receive all of their daily water intake

from the river over a 64-day period each year for a combined thirty year period.

All metals, at all sampling sites, were below these risk-based recreational screening levels. Under the federal Safe Drinking Water Act and state water quality standards, metals must be effectively treated and removed from source water used as a drinking water supply.

The agency has made all sampling data available to the Navajo Nation so that they can compare them to the Nation's standards for agriculture and drinking.

Before using the river this spring for recreation, irrigation, agriculture and drinking, local residents should consult local health authorities about normal precautions that result from seasonal changes to the Rivers.

EPA, States, Tribes and local Governments are working together to determine the next steps for monitoring.

**3. Begaye also said he doesn't expect the Navajo Nation and affected farmers will receive full compensation from the EPA for the spill, which he estimated to be about \$1 million.**

On March 10, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency provided \$157,756 to Navajo Nation government agencies for costs incurred during the response to the August 2015 Gold King Mine release.

The reimbursement is for costs incurred by Navajo from August 5 to September 2, 2015 and includes: \$42,138 for drinking water; \$31,116 for installing a fiber optic cable that provided needed internet access to the Navajo Nation Emergency Operations Center; \$63,824 for sampling and supplies and \$20,678 for labor, travel and supplies to support the delivery of hay and agricultural water. EPA is continuing to review other response costs submitted by Navajo Nation.

EPA has made \$2 million immediately available for State and Tribal grant application to perform monitoring to address both early warning and seasonal monitoring. EPA continues to work with States and Tribes on any additional monitoring needs.

**Christie St. Clair**

Office of Public Affairs

Environmental Protection Agency

Washington, DC

o: 202-564-2880

m: 202-768-5780